

KEY CASES 2023





List of cases recommended by the Jurisconsult and approved by the Bureau **European Court of Human Rights**

January 2024





NOTE

A selection of the most important cases dealt with by the Court (also referred to as "key cases") is made quarterly by the Bureau, upon recommendation by the Jurisconsult (see Title I, Chapters II and III, of the Rules of Court about their respective roles). This list contains the selection of key cases for 2023.

Cases are listed by reference to the relevant Convention Articles and keywords, then alphabetically by respondent State and by applicant. They are also listed under the importance level "Key cases" in the HUDOC case-law database.

By default, all references are to Chamber judgments. Grand Chamber cases, whether judgments or decisions, are indicated by "[GC]". Decisions are indicated by "(dec.)".

Chamber judgments that are not yet "final" within the meaning of Article 44 of the Convention are marked "(not final)". In the event that any such judgment is accepted for referral to the Grand Chamber in accordance with Article 43, it will not be included in the present list.

For information on the manner of citing the Court's case-law, please see here.

Article 44 § 2 – Final judgments

The judgment of a Chamber shall become final

- (a) when the parties declare that they will not request that the case be referred to the Grand Chamber; or
- (b) three months after the date of the judgment, if reference of the case to the Grand Chamber has not been requested; or
- (c) when the panel of the Grand Chamber rejects the request to refer under Article 43.

Article 43 – Referral to the Grand Chamber

- Within a period of three months from the date of the judgment of the Chamber, any party to the case may, in exceptional cases, request that the case be referred to the Grand Chamber.
- 2. A panel of five judges of the Grand Chamber shall accept the request if the case raises a serious question affecting the interpretation or application of the Convention or the Protocols thereto, or a serious issue of general importance.
- 3. If the panel accepts the request, the Grand Chamber shall decide the case by means of a judgment.

Contents

CASES BY ARTICLE	4
CASES BY RESPONDENT STATE	16
CASES BY APPLICANT	18

Cases by Article

ARTICLE 1

JURISDICTION OF STATES

Jurisdiction of Russia over parts of Eastern Ukraine controlled by separatists

Ukraine and the Netherlands v. Russia (dec.) [GC], nos. 8019/16 et al., 30 November 2022

Decision | Legal summary

ARTICLE 3

DEGRADING TREATMENT

INHUMAN TREATMENT

Segregation, humiliation and abuse of prisoners by fellow inmates on account of inferior status in informal prisoner hierarchy tolerated by prison staff; lack of systemic State action: *violation*

S.P. and Others v. Russia, nos. 36463/11 et al., 2 May 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Consecutive enforcement of disciplinary punishments and security measures in prison resulting in protracted periods of solitary confinement: *violation*

Schmidt and Šmigol v. Estonia, nos. 3501/20 et al., 28 November 2023 (not final)

Judgment | Legal summary

POSITIVE OBLIGATIONS

Segregation, humiliation and abuse of prisoners by fellow inmates on account of inferior status in informal prisoner hierarchy tolerated by prison staff; lack of systemic State action: *violation*

S.P. and Others v. Russia, nos. 36463/11 et al., 2 May 2023

ARTICLE 4

TRAFFICKING IN HUMAN BEINGS | POSITIVE OBLIGATIONS

Domestic courts' dismissal of compensation claim of trafficking victim against her trafficker in respect of lost earnings from coerced prostitution: *violation*

Krachunova v. Bulgaria, no. 18269/18, 28 November 2023 (not final)

Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 6

Article 6 § 1 (civil)

CIVIL RIGHTS AND OBLIGATIONS

Advisory opinion on the procedural status and rights of a biological parent in proceedings for the adoption of an adult

Advisory opinion requested by the Supreme Court of Finland [GC], request no. P16-2022-001, 13 April 2023

Opinion | Legal summary

ACCESS TO COURT

Advisory opinion on the procedural status and rights of a biological parent in proceedings for the adoption of an adult

Advisory opinion requested by the Supreme Court of Finland [GC], request no. P16-2022-001, 13 April 2023

Opinion | Legal summary

Domestic courts' failure to examine the merits of a claim, subsuming case facts under relevant law provision under the principle *jura novit curia*, absent arguments to this effect from the claimant: *inadmissible*

FU QUAN, s.r.o. v. the Czech Republic [GC], no. 24827/14, 1 June 2023

FAIR HEARING

REASONABLE TIME

INDEPENDENT TRIBUNAL

IMPARTIAL TRIBUNAL

Reversal by Supreme Court's Chamber of Extraordinary Review and Public Affairs of final civil defamation judgment in applicant's favour taken ten years earlier, following Prosecutor General's extraordinary appeal: *violation*

Wałęsa v. Poland, no. 50849/21, 23 November 2023 (not final)

Judgment | Legal summary

Article 6 § 1 (criminal)

FAIR HEARING

Prejudice to the defence on account of non-disclosure of raw data obtained from ByLock server not counterbalanced by adequate procedural safeguards: *violation*

Yüksel Yalçınkaya v. Türkiye [GC], no. 15669/20, 26 September 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 7

NULLUM CRIMEN SINE LEGE

NULLA POENA SINE LEGE

Conviction for membership of an armed terrorist organisation based decisively on use of encrypted messaging application ByLock, without establishing offence's constituent material and mental elements in an individualised manner: *violation*

Yüksel Yalçınkaya v. Türkiye [GC], no. 15669/20, 26 September 2023

ARTICLE 8

RESPECT FOR PRIVATE LIFE

Unjustified search of journalists' home and indiscriminate seizure of their personal belongings: *violation*

Svetova and Others v. Russia, no. 54714/17, 24 January 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Refusal by the national authorities to insert the term "neutral" or "intersex", instead of "male", on the birth certificate of an intersex person: *no violation*

Y v. France, no. 76888/17, 31 January 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Unjustified publication of applicant's identifying data, including home address, on tax authority website portal, for failing to fulfil his tax obligations: *violation*

L.B. v. Hungary [GC], no. 36345/16, 9 March 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Legal impossibility for transgender parent's current gender, disconnected from biological reality, to be indicated on birth certificate of child conceived after gender reclassification: no violation

A.H. and Others v. Germany, no. 7246/20, 4 April 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Legal impossibility for transgender parent's current gender, disconnected from biological reality, to be indicated on birth certificate of child conceived after gender reclassification: no violation

O.H. and G.H. v. Germany, nos. 53568/18 and 54741/18, 4 April 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Unjustified processing of applicant's personal biometric data by using highly intrusive facial recognition technology in administrative offence proceedings to identify, locate and arrest him: *violation*

Glukhin v. Russia, no. 11519/20, 4 July 2023

Failure to act with due diligence to assist a vulnerable minor, a Spanish national born abroad, to obtain birth registration not secured by his available parent, and consequently identity documents: *violation*

G.T.B. v. Spain, no. 3041/19, 16 November 2023 (not final)

Judgment | Legal summary

Reversal by Supreme Court's Chamber of Extraordinary Review and Public Affairs of final civil defamation judgment in applicant's favour taken ten years earlier, following Prosecutor General's extraordinary appeal: *violation*

Wałęsa v. Poland, no. 50849/21, 23 November 2023 (not final)

Judgment | Legal summary

RESPECT FOR FAMILY LIFE

Refusal of family reunification requests, for not fulfilling financial independence requirement, of provisionally admitted refugees fearing persecution because of their illegal exit from their country of origin: *violation*; *no violation*

B.F. and Others v. Switzerland, nos. 13258/18 et al., 4 July 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

RESPECT FOR PRIVATE AND FAMILY LIFE

Advisory opinion on the procedural status and rights of a biological parent in proceedings for the adoption of an adult

Advisory opinion requested by the Supreme Court of Finland [GC], request no. P16-2022-001, 13 April 2023

Opinion | Legal summary

RESPECT FOR HOME

Unjustified search of journalists' home and indiscriminate seizure of their personal belongings: *violation*

Svetova and Others v. Russia, no. 54714/17, 24 January 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

POSITIVE OBLIGATIONS

Absence of any form of legal recognition and protection for samesex couples: *violation*

Fedotova and Others v. Russia [GC], nos. 40792/10 et al., 17 January 2023

Refusal of family reunification requests, for not fulfilling financial independence requirement, of provisionally admitted refugees fearing persecution because of their illegal exit from their country of origin: *violation*; *no violation*

B.F. and Others v. Switzerland, nos. 13258/18 et al., 4 July 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Failure to act with due diligence to assist a vulnerable minor, a Spanish national born abroad, to obtain birth registration not secured by his available parent, and consequently identity documents: *violation*

G.T.B. v. Spain, no. 3041/19, 16 November 2023 (not final)

Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 9

MANIFEST RELIGION OR BELIEF

Advisory opinion as to whether an individual may be denied authorisation to work as a security guard or officer on account of being close to or belonging to a religious movement

Advisory opinion requested by the *Conseil d'État* of Belgium [GC], request no. P16-2023-001, 14 December 2023

Opinion | Legal summary

ARTICLE 10

FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION

No legitimate aim for temporary suspension of children's fairy tale book depicting same-sex relationships and its subsequent labelling as harmful to children under the age of 14: *violation*

Macatė v. Lithuania [GC], no. 61435/19, 23 January 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Criminal fine of EUR 1,000 for disclosing to the media confidential documents from a private-sector employer concerning the tax practices of multinational companies ("Luxleaks"): *violation*

Halet v. Luxembourg [GC], no. 21884/18, 14 February 2023

Elected politician fined in criminal proceedings for failing to delete, from his publicly accessible Facebook "wall" used for his election campaign, Islamophobic comments by third parties also convicted: *no violation*

Sanchez v. France [GC], no. 45581/15, 15 May 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Unjustified administrative offence conviction of a peaceful solo demonstrator, using a life-size cardboard figure of a political activist with a banner, for failure to submit prior notification: *violation*

Glukhin v. Russia, no. 11519/20, 4 July 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Newspaper publisher ordered to anonymise the online archived version of a lawful article published twenty years earlier, on grounds of the "right to be forgotten" of the individual responsible for a fatal accident: *no violation*

Hurbain v. Belgium [GC], no. 57292/16, 4 July 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

FREEDOM TO IMPART INFORMATION

No legitimate aim for temporary suspension of children's fairy tale book depicting same-sex relationships and its subsequent labelling as harmful to children under the age of 14: *violation*

Macatė v. Lithuania [GC], no. 61435/19, 23 January 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Criminal fine of EUR 1,000 for disclosing to the media confidential documents from a private-sector employer concerning the tax practices of multinational companies ("Luxleaks"): *violation*

Halet v. Luxembourg [GC], no. 21884/18, 14 February 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Newspaper publisher ordered to anonymise the online archived version of a lawful article published twenty years earlier, on grounds of the "right to be forgotten" of the individual responsible for a fatal accident: *no violation*

Hurbain v. Belgium [GC], no. 57292/16, 4 July 2023

ARTICLE 11

FREEDOM OF ASSOCIATION

Proscription of applicant association, entailing its dissolution and asset confiscation, due to considerable financial donations to charitable societies linked to the terrorist organisation Hamas: *no violation*

Internationale Humanitäre Hilfsorganisation e. V. v. Germany, no. 11214/19, 10 October 2023 (not final)

Judgment | Legal summary

Disciplinary sanctions on teachers with civil-servant status for participating during their working hours in strikes organised by their trade union, in breach of the constitutional ban on civil servants striking: *no violation*

Humpert and Others v. Germany [GC], nos. 59433/18 et al., 14 December 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 33

INTER-STATE APPLICATION

Alleged administrative practices by Russia in eastern Ukraine under separatist control resulting in multiple Convention violations: *partly admissible*

Downing of Malaysian Airlines flight MH17: admissible

Ukraine and the Netherlands v. Russia (dec.) [GC], nos. 8019/16 et al., 30 November 2022

Decision | Legal summary

ARTICLE 34

PETITION

Recharacterisation of applicant's complaint by Chamber extending scope of case beyond that initially referred to it in the application form

Grosam v. the Czech Republic [GC], no. 19750/13, 1 June 2023

VICTIM

Applicant association's unjustified abandonment of authorisation request to hold a public event during Covid-19 related ban and to bring any other such request: *effect on applicant association's victim status*

Communauté Genevoise d'Action Syndicale (CGAS) v. Switzerland [GC], no. 21881/20, 27 November 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 35

ARTICLE 35-3-A

RATIONE TEMPORIS

Limits of Court's jurisdiction with respect to acts or omissions spanning across the date on which a respondent State ceased to be a Party to the Convention: *communicated; remainder inadmissible*

Pivkina and Others v. Russia (dec.), nos. 2134/23 et al., 6 June 2023

Decision | Legal summary

Article 35 § 1

EXHAUSTION OF DOMESTIC REMEDIES

No effective remedy available in Russia to relatives of victims of Malaysian Airlines flight MH17: admissible

International investigation into downing of flight MH17 and use of international-law remedies before applying to the Court (six years after the incident): application within time-limit

Ukraine and the Netherlands v. Russia (dec.) [GC], nos. 8019/16 et al., 30 November 2022

Decision | Legal summary

Available remedy of a preliminary ruling on constitutionality in an ordinary appeal against a refusal to hold a public event based on a federal ordinance banning such events at the start of the Covid-19 pandemic: *inadmissible*

Communauté Genevoise d'Action Syndicale (CGAS) v. Switzerland [GC], no. 21881/20, 27 November 2023

FOUR-MONTH PERIOD (FORMER SIX-MONTH)

No effective remedy available in Russia to relatives of victims of Malaysian Airlines flight MH17: admissible

International investigation into downing of flight MH17 and use of international-law remedies before applying to the Court (six years after the incident): application within time-limit

Ukraine and the Netherlands v. Russia (dec.) [GC], nos. 8019/16 et al., 30 November 2022

Decision | Legal summary

Final domestic decision arrived at before, but notified after, entry into force on 1 February 2022 of new time-limit under Protocol No. 15: six-month rule applicable

Orhan v. Türkiye (dec.), no. 38358/22, 6 December 2022

Decision | Legal summary

Later addition by applicant of new complaint, after initial communication of the case to the respondent Government, not within the six-month time-limit: *inadmissible*

Grosam v. the Czech Republic [GC], no. 19750/13, 1 June 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 41

JUST SATISFACTION

Award of non-pecuniary damages to applicant Government, for benefit of identified victims, based only on evidence submitted by it in view of respondent Government's failure to participate in proceedings

Georgia v. Russia (II) (just satisfaction) [GC], no. 38263/08, 28 April 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 46

GENERAL MEASURES (PILOT JUDGMENT)

Respondent State required to take rapid and adequate measures to address systemic and interrelated problems connected with the malfunctioning of domestic legislation and practice

Wałęsa v. Poland, no. 50849/21, 23 November 2023 (not final)

Article 46 § 2

EXECUTION OF JUDGMENT

GENERAL MEASURES

Respondent state required to take general measures to address systemic problem regarding domestic courts' approach to use of ByLock

Yüksel Yalçınkaya v. Türkiye [GC], no. 15669/20, 26 September 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

ARTICLE 1 PARA. 2 OF PROTOCOL NO. 1

CONTROL OF THE USE OF PROPERTY

Company's failure to duly raise before domestic courts complaints of authorities' failure to take good care of its seized property and undue delay in lifting the seizure: *inadmissible*

FU QUAN, s.r.o. v. the Czech Republic [GC], no. 24827/14, 1 June 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 4

FREEDOM OF MOVEMENT

Sufficient procedural safeguards attaching to thirteen-month preventive curfew imposed on radicalised Islamist during state of emergency following terrorist attacks: *no violation*

Pagerie v. France, no. 24203/16, 19 January 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

PROTOCOL No. 16

ADVISORY OPINION

Advisory opinion on the procedural status and rights of a biological parent in proceedings for the adoption of an adult

Advisory opinion requested by the Supreme Court of Finland [GC], request no. P16-2022-001, 13 April 2023

Opinion | Legal summary

Advisory opinion as to whether an individual may be denied authorisation to work as a security guard or officer on account of being close to or belonging to a religious movement

Advisory opinion requested by the *Conseil d'État* of Belgium [GC], request no. P16-2023-001, 14 December 2023

Opinion | Legal summary

RULE 44C OF THE RULES OF COURT

FAILURE TO PARTICIPATE EFFECTIVELY

Respondent State's failure to engage with the proceedings after the cessation of its membership of the Council of Europe not an obstacle *per se* for the Court's examination of the case

Svetova and Others v. Russia, no. 54714/17, 24 January 2023

Cases by respondent State

BELGIUM

Hurbain v. Belgium [GC], no. 57292/16, 4 July 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

BULGARIA

Krachunova v. Bulgaria, no. 18269/18, 28 November 2023 (not final)

Judgment | Legal summary

CZECH REPUBLIC

FU QUAN, s.r.o. v. the Czech Republic [GC], no. 24827/14, 1 June 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Grosam v. the Czech Republic [GC], no. 19750/13, 1 June 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

ESTONIA

Schmidt and Šmigol v. Estonia, nos. 3501/20 et al., 28 November 2023 (not final)

Judgment | Legal summary

FRANCE

Pagerie v. France, no. 24203/16, 19 January 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Sanchez v. France [GC], no. 45581/15, 15 May 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Y v. France, no. 76888/17, 31 January 2023 Judgment | Legal summary

GERMANY

A.H. and Others v. Germany, no. 7246/20, 4 April 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Humpert and Others v. Germany [GC], nos. 59433/18 et al., 14 December 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Internationale Humanitäre Hilfsorganisation e. V. v. Germany, no. 11214/19, 10 October 2023 (not final)

Judgment | Legal summary

O.H. and G.H. v. Germany, nos. 53568/18 and 54741/18, 4 April 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

HUNGARY

L.B. v. Hungary [GC], no. 36345/16, 9 March 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

LITHUANIA

Macatė v. Lithuania [GC], no. 61435/19, 23 January 2023

LUXEMBOURG

Halet v. Luxembourg [GC], no. 21884/18, 14 February 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

POLAND

Wałęsa v. Poland, no. 50849/21, 23 November 2023 (not final)

Judgment | Legal summary

RUSSIA

Fedotova and Others v. Russia [GC], nos. 40792/10 et al., 17 January 2023 Judgment | Legal summary

Georgia v. Russia (II) (just satisfaction) [GC], no. 38263/08, 28 April 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Glukhin v. Russia, no. 11519/20, 4 July 2023 Judgment | Legal summary

Pivkina and Others v. Russia (dec.), nos. 2134/23 et al., 6 June 2023

Decision | Legal summary

S.P. and Others v. Russia, nos. 36463/11 et al., 2 May 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Svetova and Others v. Russia, no. 54714/17, 24 January 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Ukraine and the Netherlands v. Russia (dec.) [GC], nos. 8019/16 et al., 30 November 2022 Decision | Legal summary

SPAIN

G.T.B. v. Spain, no. 3041/19, 16 November 2023 (not final)

Judgment | Legal summary

SWITZERLAND

B.F. and Others v. Switzerland, nos. 13258/18 et al., 4 July 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Communauté Genevoise d'Action Syndicale (CGAS) v. Switzerland [GC], no. 21881/20, 27 November 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

TÜRKİYE

Orhan v. Türkiye (dec.), no. 38358/22, 6 December 2022

Decision | Legal summary

Yüksel Yalçınkaya v. Türkiye [GC], no. 15669/20, 26 September 2023

Cases by applicant

A

A.H. and Others v. Germany, no. 7246/20, 4 April 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

B

B.F. and Others v. Switzerland, nos. 13258/18 et al., 4 July 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

C

Communauté Genevoise d'Action Syndicale (CGAS) v. Switzerland [GC], no. 21881/20, 27 November 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

F

Fedotova and Others v. Russia [GC], nos. 40792/10 et al., 17 January 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

FU QUAN, s.r.o. v. the Czech Republic [GC], no. 24827/14, 1 June 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

G

Georgia v. Russia (II) (just satisfaction) [GC], no. 38263/08, 28 April 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Glukhin v. Russia, no. 11519/20, 4 July 2023 Judgment | Legal summary

Grosam v. the Czech Republic [GC], no. 19750/13, 1 June 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

G.T.B. v. Spain, no. 3041/19, 16 November 2023 (not final)

Judgment | Legal summary

H

Halet v. Luxembourg [GC], no. 21884/18, 14 February 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Humpert and Others v. Germany [GC], nos. 59433/18 et al., 14 December 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Hurbain v. Belgium [GC], no. 57292/16, 4 July 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Internationale Humanitäre Hilfsorganisation e. V. v. Germany, no. 11214/19, 10 October 2023 (not final)

K

Krachunova v. Bulgaria, no. 18269/18, 28 November 2023 (not final)

Judgment | Legal summary

L

L.B. v. Hungary [GC], no. 36345/16, 9 March 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

M

Macatė v. Lithuania [GC], no. 61435/19, 23 January 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

0

O.H. and G.H. v. Germany, nos. 53568/18 and 54741/18, 4 April 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Orhan v. Türkiye (dec.), no. 38358/22, 6 December 2022

Decision | Legal summary

P

Pagerie v. France, no. 24203/16, 19 January 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Pivkina and Others v. Russia (dec.), nos. 2134/23 et al., 6 June 2023

Decision | Legal summary

S

Sanchez v. France [GC], no. 45581/15, 15 May 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Schmidt and Šmigol v. Estonia, nos. 3501/20 et al., 28 November 2023 (not final)

Judgment | Legal summary

S.P. and Others v. Russia, nos. 36463/11 et al., 2 May 2023

Judgment | Legal summary

Svetova and Others v. Russia, no. 54714/17, 24 January 2023

Judgment | Legal summary



Ukraine and the Netherlands v. Russia (dec.) [GC], nos. 8019/16 et al., 30 November 2022 Decision | Legal summary



Wałęsa v. Poland, no. 50849/21, 23 November 2023 (not final)

Judgment | Legal summary



Y v. France, no. 76888/17, 31 January 2023 Judgment | Legal summary

Yüksel Yalçınkaya v. Türkiye [GC], no. 15669/20, 26 September 2023